

Please make a critical reading of the proof, using the handout entitled “Tips on Writing Proofs.”

- On your first reading of the proof, just try to get a **general idea** of what the writer is trying to do (and maybe correct some spelling or grammar).
- On the second reading, concentrate on the **factual content** of every statement.
- On the third reading, check for the things that a good proof should have:
  - Did the writer **prepare the reader** for the type of proof that follows?
  - Did the writer **restate the hypotheses**?  
If not, then there are probably some variables floating around that have no assigned meaning. See the next item.
  - Did the writer **define new variables** before using them?  
If not, put a big circle around any undefined things with a big question mark.
  - Did the writer state explicitly **where each hypothesis is used**?
  - Did the writer **justify** every step in the proof?  
If not, write “WHY?” or indicate what is missing. If the step is WRONG, give a counter-example.
  - Did the writer **tell the reader what they have shown**?

As you read the proof, you may make marks and comments directly on the paper if you wish. Then fill out the bottom part of this form and return it with the proof.

---

## FEEDBACK

Did the writer <b>prepare the reader</b> for the type of proof?	yes	no
Did the writer <b>restate the hypotheses</b> ?	yes	no
Did the writer <b>use each hypothesis</b> explicitly in the proof?	yes	no
Did the writer <b>define new variables</b> before using them?	yes	no
Did the writer <b>justify</b> every step in your proof?	yes	no
Did the writer <b>tell the reader what they have shown</b> ?	yes	no

If you could give the writer only one bit of advice to improve the write-up, what would it be?